13 March 2011

To members of the Legislative Review Committee re


The doctors of Medicine with Morality, in accord with our statement of belief, are irrevocably opposed to the creation of human life for its destruction and to cloning as a means of creating that life. We believe these matters highlight boundaries that should never have been crossed.

We are therefore opposed to research used to obtain stem cells from embryos (ES cells) and we hold that any mixing of human genes with animal genes is also unacceptable.

We are excited that reports show that induced pluri-potent stem cells (iPS cells) from the patient’s own tissues – thereby avoiding any tissue matching conflict – have the advantages of ES cells without the need to create and then destroy an embryo. We are aware that iPS cells have been able to be converted into a wide-range of cell types and lines.

We are further encouraged by the recent report of “direct reprogramming strategy”\(^1\) where mouse fibroblasts have been turned into cardiac muscle cells directly without having to go through a pluripotency stage.

These developments affirm that there is no scientific necessity for destructive embryo research or cloning to create such embryos. We affirm the UN Declaration on Human Cloning 2005 that cloning is “incompatible with human dignity and the protection of human life”\(^2\)

**We therefore recommend that human cloning be once again prohibited.**

**We further recommend that the provision allowing oocytes to be extracted from the bodies of aborted female babies for the purpose of embryo creation be reversed.**

The prospect of incentives being offered to women to donate eggs for research is disturbing when the acknowledged severe medical risks, even if considered rare, are considered. Any offer of lower costs (to donate eggs) for women undergoing ART (IVF), while superficially laudable to allow more women access

---


to ART, should be considered manipulative of a woman's hope to have and love a child. The price of such an offer – that some of her embryos will be created explicitly for destruction – should never be asked.

**We recommend that oocyte donation solely for purposes of research be prohibited and that no consideration be given to cost-reduction for women undergoing egg retrieval for purposes of ART, nor any other incentive be offered to use eggs for research.**

Under the present law in Australia the **creation of animal-human hybrids is prohibited** despite this being one of the Lockhart review recommendations. However we are aware that such hybrids are now permitted in UK and we strongly recommend retention of the present prohibition.

Dr Lachlan Dunjey MBBS FRACGP DObstRCOG General Practice (contact person)
33 Bunya St Dianella WA 6059
mob 0407 937 513

**Panel of Reference:**
Dr Peter Coleman MBBS Palliative Care; General Practice
51 Marshall St New Lambton NSW 2305

Dr Anthony Herbert MBBS BMedSci FRACP Paediatric Oncology and Palliative Care
54 Prospect St, Wynnum North Qld 4178

Dr Robert Pollnitz MBBS FRACP Paediatrics
1 Kermode Street North Adelaide SA 5006

Dr Cornelis Buma MBBS DRCOG BTheol General Practice
1A Wrotham Place Marangaroo WA 6064

Professor Kuruvilla George MBBS MPhil DPM FRCPsych FRANZCP Aged Mental Health
Locked Bag No.1 PO Forest Hill Victoria 3131

Dr Louise Butler MBBS FRACGP DRANZCOG Grad Dip Rural General Practice
Central Clinic, 76 Todd St, Alice Springs, PO Box 719 Alice Springs 0871

**Signatories:**
Dr John Francis MB BS FRACGP Sb St J Total General Practice
3 La Perouse Rd Frenchman Bay WA 6330

Dr Felicity Wild MB BS General Practice
26 McGilvray Ave Morley WA 6062

Dr. John MacLean MBBS General Practice
2 Judith Court Aspendale Gardens Vic 3195

Dr Gregory Bennett MB BS(Syd) FRACP MMed Clin Epi Consultant Geriatrics and General Hospital Medicine
185 Fox Valley Rd Wahroonga NSW 2076

Dr Ian Denness MBBS DCH FRACGP General Practice; Mission Medicine
c/- 40 Harrison St Box Hill North Vic 3129

Dr Robyn James MBBS FRACGP DRANZCOG Women's Health
97 Allen St, Hamilton Qld 4007

**NO confusion! We must not devalue human life!**
NO confusion! We must not devalue human life!
NO confusion! We must not devalue human life!
Dr Norman Hohl MBBS DTM&H FAFPHM General Practice
95 Nerang Street Southport Qld 4215

Dr Richard Chittleborough MBBS FRACGP Residential Aged Care
21 Field Street Reynella SA 5161

Dr Peter Keith MBBS DTM&H GP
547 Kooringal Rd WAGGA WAGGA NSW 2650

Dr Susan Shaw MBBS DRACOG General Practice
"The Surgery" Hardie Rd Albany WA 6330

Dr Carolyn Russell MBBS FRACGP Mast Counselling DipRACOG GP Counselling
Foundations Counselling Centre Shop 7 Clock Corner, Beams Rd Carseldine Qld 4034

Dr Dennis Humphrey MBBS FRCS FRANZCOG Head Discipline O & G
4 Lasswade Avenue Dynnyrne Tas 7005

Dr John North MBBS FRACS
23 Osterley Road Yeronga Brisbane Qld 4104

Dr Margaret Payne MBBS FRANZCOG FRCOG BCouns Obstetrics & Gynaecology (retired)
124 Helmsman Bvd St Huberts Island NSW 2257

Dr David van der Moezel MBBS DRANZCOG DCH General Practice
3/4 Wisteria Pde Edgewater WA 6027

Dr Petrina Hamilton MBBS Hospital Resident
51 Imbros Street Nundah Qld 4012

Dr John Fluit MBBS DRANZCOG GP
92 Elder Lambton NSW 2299

Dr Wendy Bourke MBBS FRANZP Psychiatry
12 Atkinson Road Nambour Qld 4560

Dr Luke McLindon MBBS FRACGP O&G Registrar
24 Blackwood St Mitchelton Qld 4053

Mr Mark Hurworth MBChB FRACS Orthopaedic Surgeon
95 Broadway, Nedlands WA 6009

Dr Harry Dumbell MBChB MRCGP FRACP Paediatrics
11 Congdon Way Booragoon WA 6154

Dr Colin Broun MBBS FRACGP General Practice
5 Gum Glade Mundaring WA 6073

Dr Amanda Lamont MBBS GP Fertility Care
15/162 Wanneroo Rd Yokine WA 6060

Dr Neill Kling MBChB FRACS Surgeon
Suite 19 SJOG Medical Centre College Grove Bunbury WA 6230

Dr Margaret Cover MBBS BSc FRANZCP Psychiatry (Retired)
25 Exeter Road Wahroonga NSW 2076

Dr Tze Khor MBBS(Hons) Anatomical Pathology
350 Coode Street Dianella WA 6059

---

NO confusion! We must not devalue human life!
NO confusion! We must not devalue human life!
NO confusion! We must not devalue human life!
NO confusion! We must not devalue human life!
NO confusion! We must not devalue human life!
NO confusion! We must not devalue human life!
NO confusion! We must not devalue human life!
NO confusion! We must not devalue human life!
Signatories to *Medicine With Morality*, in order to become members, agree with the belief statement regarding the meaning and value of human life at [www.medicinewithmorality.org.au](http://www.medicinewithmorality.org.au)

This submission is in accord with the belief statement and, as is usual, has also gone out to members for review. Hence it is reliable to include the names of signatories to this submission.